# Pennsylvania Teachers Advisory Committee BRIEF 

# About the Pennsylvania Teachers Advisory Committee 

## Vision

All students thriving in a quality education system shaped by teacher expertise
Mission
To ensure essential decisions that impact students are informed by expert teachers


#### Abstract

About The Pennsylvania Teachers Advisory Committee (PTAC) is a non-profit organization composed of active classroom teachers from across the Commonwealth who have been recognized as expert practitioners and demonstrated professional leadership.


## PTAC Members have been recognized for teaching excellence by these organizations and others like them:

- American Association of School Librarians
- Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation
- Center for Creative Learning through the Arts
- Future Farmers of America
- Gilder Lehrman Institute of American History
- GRAMMY Educator Awards
- Global Teacher Prize
- International Society for Technology in Education
- International Technology and Engineering Educators

Association

- Microsoft
- Milken Family Foundation
- NASA
- National Board for Professional Teaching Standards
- National Education Association
- National Liberty Museum
- National Geographic Society
- National School Boards Association
- National Science Foundation
- National Science Teacher Association
- Pennsylvania Art Education Association
- Pennsylvania Association of Educational

Communications and Technology

- Pennsylvania Association of School Retirees
- Pennsylvania School Librarians Association
- Pennsylvania Department of Education
- Philadelphia Home and School Council
- US Department of Education
- US Department of State
- Yale University
- Veterans of Foreign Wars
- Voya



## Executive Summary

According to a survey conducted by the Pennsylvania Teachers Advisory Committee (PTAC) in February 2021, a large majority of active classroom teachers in the Commonwealth ( $85.8 \%$ ) indicate COVID-related staff absences in their schools had a negative impact on students this year. Respondents who indicated there was no impact because their students have been in a fully-remote instructional model for the entirety of the 2020-2021 school year prior to the survey were not factored in any of the data in this brief.

Teachers indicating minimal or no impact from COVID-related staff absences did not give much detail, however, several trends emerged among responses from those who indicated that students were negatively impacted. These included that COVIDrelated staff absences...

- lessened quality in-person teaching/learning
- negatively impacted students due to inconsistency and disrupted routines
- restricted or narrowed the curricula
- created staffing issues that reduced the quality of teaching
- negatively affected student mental health
- negatively affected teacher mental health and ability to teach effectively
- created or exasperated equity gaps
- generally had a negative impact on students


## How have COVID-related staff

 absences this year impacted students in your school/district?

Methodology

PTAC conducted an online survey of current Pennsylvania classroom teachers from February $23-26$, 2021. This survey asked questions about standardized testing the 2020-2021 school year. 528 teachers replied.

One of the questions asked, "How have COVID-related staff absences this year impacted students in your school/district?" This query received 320 responses related to this question. There were many responses indicating that this question was not relevant due to a fully remote instructional model. These responses were neither included in the data nor the narrative provided in this brief.

The relevant responses to this question were analyzed and found to fall into 9 broad categories. Many responses indicated multiple reasons that COVID-related absences had negatively impacted students. In these instances, the response was grouped with the category with which it most closely aligned. The narratives included in this briefing will often show how closely related some of these categories were.

This brief includes a summary of responses in each category and individual teacher narratives that exemplify responses in those categories. Included comments and narratives were selected to be representative of the broader set of qualitative data.

The survey also included questions about geographic locale to allow insight into equity in different areas of the Commonwealth. Geographic locale was determined by using National Center for Education Statistics (NCES) designations. To match PTAC's categories of "Large Urban", "Small Urban", "Suburban", and "Rural", the following correlations were made:

| NCES Designation | PTAC Category |
| :--- | :--- |
| City - Large (Philadelphia and Pittsburgh) | Large Urban |
| City - Midsize | Small Urban |
| City - Small | Suburban |
| Suburban - Large |  |
| Suburban - Midsize |  |
| Suburban - Small | Rural |
| Town - Fringe |  |
| Town - Remote |  |
| Town - Distant | Rural - Fringe |
| Rural - Distant |  |
| Rural - Remote |  |

## Quality of Instruction

The most common way in which teachers indicated COVID-related staff absences had negatively impacted students was by lessening the quality of instruction that students received (19.8\% of responses). Responses in this category included teachers who pointed to the closing of school buildings due to staff absences, lost access to in-person teaching from absent teachers, and a transition to fully-digital asynchronous content in lieu of live teaching as significant factors. Several expressed simultaneous appreciation that their districts allowed sick teachers to connect with students from home and acknowledgement that remote teaching is a lesser-quality substitute for live instruction.

A rural elementary teacher:
When teachers have been sick, kids have to learn remotely. These children often have no support at home to learn basic concepts or deal with technology issues. Kids cannot navigate the technology successfully. They are unprepared and often leave materials at school. Many students turn on the device, log in, and walk away. No matter what the teacher is does on their end, the virtual classroom is unsuccessful for those students that are not technologically savvy, selfmotivated, or adequately supported at home.

A suburban elementary teacher:
When a special education aide or support teacher needs to be pulled to cover a class that has no substitute, it negatively impacts my students who would receive services. Also, when a teacher has to quarantine, we are told to post asynchronous lessons and activities for the students. For every teacher quarantined that leads to at least 10 days of lost face-to-face time with students.

A suburban high-school teacher:
COVID-related staff absences have impacted my students greatly! High school students see their teachers one day a week. When that teacher is absent, they see the teacher once every two weeks. We now have teachers who left and the instruction is all online for honors math classes. It is the end of February and some students have only had 12 face to face days with their teachers!

A middle-school teacher in a large urban school:
The number of teachers who have had COVID is high. When a teacher is absent the students complete asynchronous work. There are continuity gaps due to teacher absences. Teachers are working their behinds off to still adhere to the curriculum pacing guide, but even when we were in school it was hard to cover every single thing on the PSSA tests.

| Additional Responses about Quality of Instruction (geographic locale and grade level in parentheses) |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Due to staff absences, we have been forced to close our buildings and teach virtually. I have also been asked to cover other duties outside of my typical school day. This has taken time away from my own students as well as time away from being able to plan and prepare for upcoming lessons. (Rural, HS) | Many students have been left to learn from either a substitute for a lengthy period of time or from their teacher teaching from a remote setting. There is no comparison to having the teacher teaching IN the classroom. I feel much has been lost due to this. (Suburban, Elem) |
| Many teachers have been quarantined and have had to teach from home Zooming into their own classrooms. Instruction via Zoom and blended class with students in the classroom and online at the same time has been a major challenge for all educators during the pandemic. (Suburban, MS) | Remote learning is not the best way for students to learn content. Absences have had a huge impact on teaching and any higher order thinking that could be used within our classes. It is hard to try to challenge our students through a computer screen. (Suburban, Elem) |
| There have been many times that students have had substitutes due to teachers having to quarantine. It also caused us to switch to remote learning. Our students have only been in person 43 days this year. Of those days, some have had substitute teachers for a portion of them. At times there are not full day substitutes available so support staff or administrators have had to full those roles. (Suburban, HS) | Three of my family members tested positive for Covid. I tested negative. Because of my quarantine l've missed over 2 weeks of teaching. I have been told by my school district I will need to take sick days for my absence and am NOT allowed to teach virtual during this time, even though we have the technology to do so. Other teachers are covering my classes, but not offering instruction. My students must now submit work with limited direction, feedback, or connection. (Small Urban, Elem) |
| At one point the school had to move from a hybrid model to $100 \%$ virtual because we did not have enough staff available to keep the building open (due to positive cases and quarantine requirements). (Rural, MS) | Students have been learning virtually a lot of the time. They feel as if they don't have to do any work, or they do it but lose out on some of the comprehension because of missing the face-to-face interactions that traditional school provides. (Rural, HS) |
| Students have had more asynchronous work at times when staff members were absent. (Large Urban, MS) | Virtual instruction due to staff COVID absences is the large factor in what has impacted my student learning. Teachers can see student work and growth in person and help with needs immediately in a private conversation which cannot be done online. (Rural, Elem) |

## Staffing and Substitute Shortages

$18 \%$ of respondents listed issues with staffing and substitutes as the primary factor in COVID-related absences causing negative student impact this year, making it the second most common concern. These responses included many concerns about the unavailability of substitute teachers and lack of substitute teacher quality. Other concerns in this area included teachers covering subject areas in which they were uncertified and/or unqualified and students having classes replaced with study halls due to a lack of available staff.

A teacher in a rural middle school:

Our district has a severe substitute shortage. We have no day-to-day substitutes in our elementary schools. When any member of a team is absent, the other teachers on that team are expected to cover. Since we have no additional personnel to help in this situation, classroom teachers end up watching double classes. This results in students completing their work for the absent teacher independently, almost as if they were an asynchronous virtual learner. Many of our students struggle on these days, and we do our best to ensure the best possible situation for everyone, but staff absences create a severe strain on student learning.

A suburban high-school teacher:
Our staff is doing their best to cover classes they have no experience teaching. They push themselves to give every ounce of what they have at the expense of their own well-being and at times that of their families. We know we are just a Band-Aid to a much larger problem. We need to attract qualified substitutes to come into schools and teach. We need to value their importance in public education.

An elementary teacher in a small urban school:
There is a dire need for substitute teachers; if a teacher is absent, the coverage is typically an in-house teacher that has to give up their planning period. This affects not only the quality of teaching in the classroom that is being covered, but also the classroom whose teacher had to give up time to plan for their own students.

A teacher in a suburban middle school:
There aren't teachers to be hired. There aren't support staff to be hired. Courses are being taught with one teacher for 50 students. These shortages have been in place for a while, but COVID has really exposed the problem for everyone to see.

| Additional Responses about Staffing Issues (geographic locale and grade level in parentheses) |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Many staff have had to take leave. We have an inadequate number of substitutes to cover. In the event a teacher has been taken ill or been hospitalized, there is often no member of the staff qualified to create lessons. In some cases, retirees have helped fill the gap. (Suburban, MS) | I am covering many classes when teachers are absent since we do not have substitutes available. In previous years, substitute plans would still be interactive; now, the plans continue with online work, which does not encourage in-person engagement. (Small Urban, Elem) |
| I've personally been pulled to substitute more days in 2021 than l've been in my actual classroom supporting students. That says it all. (Suburban, Elem) | Good substitutes are difficult to find in a normal year. At some points this year, the school has been forced to find anyone who would accept the substitute job to fill in for the time period. This situation has not benefited students at all. (Rural, HS) |
| There has been limited coverage in our school. Substitutes do not want to come into the building. We also moved to block scheduling, which has prevented teachers from covering for one another when someone is absent. I have lost prep time and 1-on-1 time with students the few times I have had to cover, and it was detrimental to the students I would have been working with. (Rural, Elem) | I was forced to take leave of absence from my position as a HS English teacher for 12 weeks. A substitute was never found for my classes, and other teachers were forced to handle my class load (via videoconferencing). These students did not see a teacher for 12 weeks. One class period never had a teacher take over. They had no instruction, no teacher, and no structure for 12 weeks. (Suburban, HS) |
| We have had a number of teachers who have left the profession (and subs can't be found), and an inadequate number of qualified subs to cover concepts and core instruction. Teaching decisions are being made based on surviving the logistics of running a school rather than for educational reasons. (Suburban, MS) | Any time a teacher is absent, the quality of instruction is negatively impacted. With the length of COVID absences, this is exacerbated. Additionally, qualified substitutes are difficult to locate, given the potential for illness in entering the school building. (Suburban, HS) |
| This year staff absences have been unfilled, and students have been given study halls. There is no learning going on in a study hall and unfortunately with teachers becoming sick they are not able to teach - even remotely. (Small Urban, HS) | We simply cannot find substitutes. The risk/reward for a daily substitute coming into a school is not worth it. The challenges of teaching both virtual and in person students at the same time make it overwhelming. (Suburban, HS) |

## Inconsistency and Lack of Routine

The third most common negative factor (14.6\%) impacting students listed in the responses was inconsistency caused by COVID-related staff absences. Teachers indicated that the disruptions to school routines and interruptions in learning schedule had serious detrimental effects on student academic performance. Some responses indicated other negative social and emotional impacts due to inconsistent routine as well.

A rural middle school teacher:
Rotating instructional models and staff absences (hybrid, school closures and staff quarantines) have really disrupted the routine students and teachers need in order to have a solid education. Some students have given up or resorted to cheating. I have 38-40 students failing my class for the year as of right now. That is a much, much higher number I have ever seen in my 26 year career.

A middle-school teacher in a small urban school:
COVID-related staff absences have been frequent, which obviously creates even more challenges to the continuity of education. The disruptions are never-ending. Students never get deep into a learning groove, which is when they make the most learning progress and engage at the highest level.

A suburban high-school teacher:
Staff being quarantined has greatly impacted the building because it makes it difficult to provide consistency. Students have all had a variety of teachers and substitutes. With the lack of outside substitutes, we have instead had to rely on our specialists. This means students are not receiving live lessons in some of the most important subjects like art, physical education, library and music. Students have had to work through far more classes without their teacher and far more asynchronous work than any other year.

An elementary teacher in a rural school:
Teachers have to quarantine and teach from home. Many were sick themselves and others were caring for family members who were sick. We do not get compensated for COVID-related absences. This means we either have to work from home regardless of how our health is, take days without pay, or use sick leave. Many special education teachers are pulled to cover for regular education teachers who are home sick, and there are no substitutes. Special education students aren't getting the services they require.

| Additional Responses about Inconsistency <br> (geographic locale and grade level in parentheses) |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| $\begin{array}{l}\text { This entire year has been isolating. Our } \\ \text { district has switched back and forth } \\ \text { between hybrid learning and fully remote } \\ \text { learning all year, so the inconsistency of } \\ \text { learning models has probably been the } \\ \text { biggest negative impact on our school. }\end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{l}\text { We have been live teaching and virtual } \\ \text { teaching simultaneously since August. } \\ \text { (Suburban, MS) }\end{array}$ |
| $\begin{array}{l}\text { The children sit alone at desks and are } \\ \text { not allowed to engage in learning } \\ \text { activities which are considered best } \\ \text { practices. At any given time, my virtual } \\ \text { numbers are very fluid depending on } \\ \text { COVID exposure. (Suburban, Elem) }\end{array}$ |  |
| $\begin{array}{l}\text { Staff absences have had a huge impact. } \\ \text { The lack of consistency has caused for }\end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{l}\text { There is just such inconsistency across } \\ \text { the board this year. Some teachers are } \\ \text { delay in content being taught and also } \\ \text { has caused teachers to be teaching } \\ \text { virtually while students are still in the } \\ \text { classroom. We have done our absolute to teach in person at all due to the } \\ \text { best, but this is not the best situation for } \\ \text { kids to be truly successful in mastering } \\ \text { content and being prepared for } \\ \text { standardized testing. (Rural, MS) }\end{array}$ |
| $\begin{array}{l}\text { pandemic. Others have had to stay home } \\ \text { suddenly after a family member has }\end{array}$ |  |
| tested positive. We are doing our best, |  |
| but oftentimes, teachers are having to |  |
| switch gears with what they were |  |
| planning on covering and what they can |  |
| realistically cover if they aren't in the |  |$\}$

## Mental Health

Many teachers who replied expressed concerns that COVID-related staff absences have negatively affected the mental health of students (6.8\%) and teachers (3.4\%). Several teachers explicitly made the connection between the erosion of a teacher's wellbeing and her/his ability to fully meet the needs of students.

Often comments attributed the decline in mental health of those in school to factors listed above such as inconsistency in routine and staffing issues, however all replies that indicated a concern about social or emotional wellbeing were included in this category.

An elementary teacher in a large urban school:
Our secretary passed away from COVID-19 and nothing has been the same since. She was the heart of our school. This added to students' stress and affected their mental health.

A suburban high school teacher:
COVID-related staff absences have caused countless and immeasurable issues. Deaths, quarantines, family separations for safety, mental illnesses, job losses. This list doesn't include the loss of things that are basic to learning: a lack of motivation, a lack of interest in school, a lack of materials. My concerts were all cancelled this year. My musical actors \& actresses lost their chance to perform the musical they've been working on since November 2019. There is no musical this year, just a narration \& song recording.

A rural middle school teacher:
Teachers sometimes have substitutes, other times teach remotely, and sometimes are covered by another teacher who is in school that day. As one example, we have one teacher in our district who started the year with her belowlevel first graders. She had to take time off when her son was in an accident. Then, she came back to work and was quickly quarantined when her husband became COVID positive. She contracted COVID shortly thereafter. The poor woman missed about 6-7 weeks during the first three months of school. Some days there was a substitute for her class, other days she taught remotely for part of the time, and on other days 8-9 different teachers combined to cover her class. Her students did not make much progress for the first grading period.

A rural elementary teacher:
Teachers have had to cover classes that they are not certified in and students are trying their best to learn through a computer screen. Students are expressing concerns of feeling helpless, overwhelmed with workloads, and feeling unprepared.

| Additional Responses about Mental Health <br> (geographic locale and grade level in parentheses) |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| Students are intimidated and hesitant. <br> They are nervous and scared. (Rural, <br> MS) | Students are struggling daily. Staff <br> absences don't help, and the challenges <br> of the past year are taking a toll <br> emotionally on every student. (Suburban, <br> HS) |
| When classroom teachers have been <br> absent due to COVID and other illnesses, <br> our students have missed their specials <br> and related arts classes because those <br> teachers get pulled to cover. Students <br> have missed that time to explore their <br> creative abilities. (Rural, Elem) | In addition to the normal disruption that <br> happens, when one of us is absent, they <br> are afraid we have COVID. When I was <br> sick in November, I messaged my <br> students that I was OK - I just had a sinus <br> infection. I normally wouldn't share my <br> health info with students, but I had |
| several email asking me if I had COVID. |  |
| Suburban, MS) |  |

## Other Notable Concerns

When responses were reviewed, $16.7 \%$ shared that COVID-related staff absences had a negative impact without either sharing further detail or by expressing concerns that did not fit into any other listed category. 4.3\% of respondents indicated that staff absences led to a narrowing of the curriculum this year which negatively affected student academic success. The primary negative factor in $1.2 \%$ of given narratives was the exacerbation and/or creation of inequity between groups of students. In order to accurately reflect the range of experiences shared in the survey, a representative set of responses is shared below.

A suburban middle-school teacher:
I am a general education teacher and the special education teacher with whom I co-teach has been pulled on a weekly basis to cover the absences of others. It has led to non-compliance with student IEPs.

A large urban high school teacher:
I have missed 7 days this year because I had COVID-19. The impact had been detrimental on my students. Many other teachers and staff have been absent as well, and in some cases their families have had COVID-19.

A small urban middle-school teacher:

Absences have increased significantly during the pandemic with a particularly negative impact on socioeconomically disadvantaged families and students.

A suburban elementary teacher:
It is February and there have been only 2 weeks when my entire 4-person teaching team has been in the building. This pandemic has been massively disruptive for the students and the staff.

A small urban elementary teacher:
We have missed a lot of time with our students and have not had the time to make up content that was missed during the school shutdown last year. We aren't getting through all of the needed material this year.

A rural middle-school teacher:
We have not covered state standards as deep as we would have liked and cannot make cross-curricular links as normal because teachers were in quarantine at times, struggling to survive remote learning, and everything else.

| Additional Responses (geographic locale and grade level in parentheses) |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| Yes, students that are at-risk are not <br> getting the traditional support they require <br> from ample amounts of in-person time <br> with professionals and instructional aides. <br> Our district is employing several long- <br> term subs and is at a major deficit in IA <br> support. (Suburban, MS) | The whole world is upside-down right <br> now. Everything, including staff <br> absences, is impacting the students. One <br> thing I do know is that teachers are going <br> above and beyond to do as much as they <br> can for their students. (Rural, Elem) |
| Everyone is doing their best, but there is <br> anything but normal instruction happening <br> in our schools. (Suburban, Elem) | The content will not be covered in its <br> entirety, nor will it be developed with the <br> depth in which we could explore it in a <br> traditional year. (Rural, HS) |
| The model under which we have <br> operated has had an impact on the <br> students. They will not cover all the <br> necessary material, nor would it even be <br> possible with how far behind we are due <br> to intermittent closures. (Rural, Elem) | Due to staff also having COVID or being <br> exposed to positive cases teachers have <br> been out of the building at least twice as <br> much as normal. This plays a large role in <br> hindering students learning. (Suburban, <br> Elem) |
| We've had to close schools on a few <br> occasions because we didn't have <br> enough healthy staff. On other occasions, <br> when teachers have been absent, their <br> classes have not been able to learn <br> effectively because the staff who were <br> brought in to cover those classes were <br> not familiar enough with the curriculum <br> and/or did not have time to plan effective <br> lessons. (Rural, HS) | Students who are identified as 'at-risk' are <br> not getting the traditional support they <br> require. This usually entails ample in- <br> person time with professionals and <br> instructional aides. Our district is <br> employing several long-term subs and <br> very short in being able to provide <br> instructional aide support. (Suburban, <br> MS) |
| Time to teach the content has been <br> affected. Students have had less time <br> and it takes them longer to grasp <br> concepts due to minimal in person <br> instruction. In addition, substitutes often <br> do not have the content knowledge that <br> the regular teacher has or the teaching <br> style to which the students have gotten <br> accustomed. (Rural, MS) | In our instructional model students could <br> only be in the classroom for two days a <br> week for most of the year. Most learning <br> was online and in an unmonitored, <br> inequitable environment. (Suburban, HS) |

## Conclusion

It is indisputable that the narratives and comments shared by classroom teachers in this survey indicated that COVID-related staff absences have had a detrimental effect on students in most Pennsylvania schools this year. This brief has endeavored to illuminate some of these impacts as well as some of the factors that are causing them.

This brief is limited in a few ways. First, because the majority of students in large urban schools (Philadelphia and Pittsburgh) have been in completely remote instructional models for the entirety of the 2020-2021 school year to this point, there are few comments from teachers in these schools reflected. Second, while we have attempted to categorize responses as a way that best illuminates the realities in Pennsylvania's schools, many of the comments were nuanced and complex enough that they realistically could have been categorized in different ways. The percentages in this brief could change slightly if a different set of reviewers were to categorize the responses differently. Finally, because this survey was shared primarily through social media and email, there is the possibility of bias in the responses toward those for whom technology and internet access are readily available.

## PTAC Board of Directors

| M | Michael Soskil, Vice-President |
| :---: | :---: |
| The 2015-16 Pennsylvania Teacher of the | The 2017-18 Pennsylvania Teacher of the |
| Year and Yale University Distinguished | Year and a 2016 Global Teacher Prize |
| Music Educator, Mairi is the orchestra director and chair of the music | Top-10 Finalist, Michael is an elementary science teacher at the Wallenpaupack |
|  |  |
|  |  |
| A National Board Certified Teacher, Brice is a special education teacher at | A 2006 Pennsylvania Teacher of the Year |
| Pittsburgh Perry High School. He teaches math and English while specializing in therapeutic support. | experience teaching science at the middle school level in the Peters Township School District. |
| Karey Killian <br> The 2017 International Society for Technology in Education Librarian of the Year, Karey helps students see themselves as explorers, makers, inventors, and solution finders in the Milton Area School District. |  |
|  | A 2017 Pennsylvania Teacher of the Year |
|  | Finalist, Allison is published in |
|  | professional journals and has received |
|  | several honors for library programming |
|  | and educational leadership in her position at Hershey HS. |
| Heather Zajdel <br> A recipient of the Fulbright Distinguished Award in Teaching and Lindback Teaching Award, Heather is a science lead and member of the Social-Emotional Learning Team in the Philadelphia School District | Rebecca Snyder |
|  | The 2009 Pennsylvania Teacher of Year, |
|  | Rebecca teaches English Language Arts |
|  | at Greater Latrobe Senior High Sch |
|  |  |
|  |  |

## Contact Information

## Pennsylvania Teachers Advisory Committee

5559 Hampton Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15206
(412) 378-5028

Email: ptacinfo@ptacvoice.org
Twitter: @ptacvoice
Website: http://ptacvoice.org

